

«Central Asian Studies World Wide»
Course Syllabi for the Study of Central Eurasia
www.fas.harvard.edu/~casww/CASWW_Syllabi.html

Prof. Henry Hale
Comparative State-Building in Central Asia and the Caucasus (DHP P226)
Syllabus for the course offered in Spring 1998
Tufts University
Fletcher School of Law and Diplomacy

Prof. Henry Hale
Department of Political Science
Indiana University
210 Woodburn Hall
Bloomington, IN 47405
U.S.A.
hhale@indiana.edu

**DHP P226: Comparative State-Building in Central Asia and the Caucasus
Spring 1998
Prof. Henry Hale**

Tel: x2137 or 495-7750
E-Mail: hhale@post.harvard.edu
Office Hours: Wed. 10am-noon, 250A Mugar
Course Meets: Thurs. 2:45 - 4:45 and 5:15 - 7:15 in Cabot 304

I. About the Course

With the discovery of energy resources potentially rivaling those in the Middle East, Central Asia and the Caucasus have catapulted to the forefront of global policy agendas after centuries of obscurity. But while this region tantalizes both Europe and Asia with a way to escape dependence on Persian Gulf oil, it lies at the intersection of Orthodox, Islamic and Confucian cultures, and some thinkers warn that it may become a frontline in a looming Clash of Civilizations. Indeed, ethnic and civil wars currently block virtually every promising export route for the Caspian basin's vast oil and gas reserves, and major powers actively exploit these divisions in the drive for influence.

In order for the West and Asia to realize their interests in developing these resources and preventing the outbreak of a major war, the new countries of Central Asia and the Caucasus must build states capable of providing domestic stability and external security. In this course, students will examine critical problems of state-building that each of these states face. Because these problems are most effectively analyzed in comparative perspective, students will first consider the experiences of other countries of the world that have faced similar problems. Then they will examine and compare the recent experiences of the Central Asian and Caucasian states themselves, determining which approaches have led to the greatest success.

The state-building process in this region is ongoing, and it is possible that students in this class will one day work for organizations which are called on to help these countries choose particular strategies. Each week students will be asked to think both analytically and prescriptively. Emphasis will be placed on how the various tasks of state-building are tightly intertwined. For the sake of analytical clarity, however, the course isolates and focuses on several key components of this process: building a stable set of relationships with other states, constructing a national identity, preventing or ending ethnic and civil conflict, instituting the right type of political regime, adopting a strategy of marketizing reform, choosing a plan for natural resource development, implementing a military strategy and providing sound political leadership.

II. Requirements

This is a seminar, and regular participation in **class discussion** is expected of everyone (30% of the final grade). The bulk of the final grade (60%) will be based on a **research paper** (20-30 pages) that must be comparative in nature (focusing on at least two Central Asian or

Transcaucasian states). Specific topics must be approved in person by the instructor. After Spring Break, each student is required to **present a prospectus** of his or her paper to the class (10% of the final grade). This prospectus (3 pages) must be made available to the other students by noon on the Tuesday before his or her presentation. Papers will be due at 5pm on Friday, May 1. Students are responsible for all reading assignments and for whatever information might be given out in class, including any announced changes in the syllabus.

III. Course Schedule and Readings Assignments

Books available for purchase at the Tufts University Bookstore:

Colton & Tucker (eds.). Patterns in Post-Soviet Leadership, 1995.

Dawisha & Parrott (eds.). Conflict, cleavage and change in Central Asia and the Caucasus, 1997.

Gleason. The Central Asian States: Discovering Independence, 1997.

Hunter. The Transcaucasus in Transition, 1994.

Huntington. Political Order in Changing Societies, 1968.

Olcott. Central Asia's New States, 1996.

Key:

** = Available for purchase at the Tufts University Bookstore and on reserve in Fletcher's library

-- = In the course binder, on reserve in Fletcher's library

++ = Will be made available during the semester

(#) = Estimates of the number of pages each assignment contains.

PART I: BUILDING STATES IN CENTRAL ASIA AND THE CAUCASUS

Week 1: Introduction: What is State-Building in the Post-Soviet South? (20)

-- Max Weber. "Politics as a Vocation," in H.H. Gerth and C. Wright Mills (eds.) From Max Weber: Essays in Sociology (NY: Oxford University Press, 1946) pp.77-83. (7)

-- S. Frederick Starr. "Making Eurasia Stable," Foreign Affairs, v.75, no.1, January/February 1996, pp.80-92. (13)

Week 2: How to Build a Successful State: Some Comparative Perspectives (199)

** Samuel P. Huntington. Political Order in Changing Societies (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1968) pp.1-32, 78-92. (47) ** May arrive late in bookstore — if so, Fletcher's library has several copies.

-- Charles Tilly. "Reflections on the History of European State-Making," in Tilly (ed.) The Formation of National States in Western Europe (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1975) pp.3-5, 38-46, 69-83. (27)

-- Youssef Cohen et al. "The Paradoxical Nature of State-Making: The Violent Creation of Order," American Political Science Review, v.75, no.4, December 1981, pp.901-10. (10)

-- Robert H. Jackson and Carl J. Rosberg. "Why African States Persist: The Empirical and Juridical in Statehood," World Politics, v.35, 1982, pp.1-25. (25)

-- Thomas M. Callaghy. The State-Society Struggle: Zaire in Comparative Perspective (NY: Columbia University Press, 1984) pp.81-110. (30)

- Joel Migdal. "Strong States, Weak States: Power and Accommodation," in Myron Weiner and Samuel Huntington (eds.) Understanding Political Development: An Analytic Study (Boston: Little Brown, 1987) pp.391-418, 428-30. (32)
- Claus Offe. "Capitalism by Democratic Design? Democratic Theory Facing the Triple Transition in East Central Europe," Social Research, v.58, no.4, Winter 1991, pp.865-892. (28)

Week 3: Central Asia and the Caucasus: The Soviet Origins of Statehood (115)

- ** Gregory Gleason. The Central Asian States: Discovering Independence (Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 1997) pp.1-24, 48-81. (57)
- Daniel Brower. "Islam and Ethnicity: Russian Colonial Policy in Turkestan," in Brower and Edward J. Lazzerini (ed.) Russia's Orient: Imperial Borderlands and Peoples, 1700-1917 (Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 1997) pp.115-35. (21)
- Steven Sabol. "The creation of Soviet Central Asia: the 1924 national delimitation," Central Asian Survey, v.14, no.2, 1995, pp.225-241. (17)
- ** Shireen T. Hunter. "The Transcaucasus: The Ethnic, Cultural, and Historical Context," in The Transcaucasus in Transition (Washington, DC: The Center for Strategic and International Studies, 1994) pp.3-21. (19)

PART II: ACHIEVING INTERNAL STABILITY

Week 4: Defining the Nation: Ethnic or Civic Identities? (190)

Comparative Perspectives: (85)

- Clifford Geertz. "The Integrative Revolution: Primordial Sentiments and Civil Politics in the New States," in Geertz, Old Societies and New States, 3rd edition (NY: The Free Press, 1967) pp.105-28. (24)
- Eugen Weber. Peasants into Frenchmen: The Modernization of Rural France, 1870-1914 (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1976) pp.95-114. (20)
- Roman Szporluk. "Introduction: Statehood and Nation-Building in Post-Soviet Space," in Szporluk (ed.) National Identity and Ethnicity in Russia and the New States of Eurasia (Armonk, NY: M.E. Sharpe, 1994) pp.3-17. (15)
- Ghia Nodia. "Nationalism and Democracy," Journal of Democracy, v.3, no.4, October 1992, and response by Francis Fukuyama, pp.3-28. (26)

Central Asia and the Caucasus: (105)

- ** Gregory Gleason. The Central Asian States: Discovering Independence (Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 1997) pp.25-47. (23)
- Stephen F. Jones. "The Georgian Language State Program and Its Implications," Nationalities Papers, v.23, no.3, 1995, pp.535-48. (14)
- Ghia Nodia. "Georgia's Identity Crisis," Journal of Democracy, v.6, no.1, January 1995, pp.104-16. (13)

Also choose at least TWO of the following sets of articles to read:

1. Kazakhstan:

- Bhavna Dave. "National Revival in Kazakstan: Language Shift and Identity Change," Post-Soviet Affairs, v.12, no.1, 1996, pp.51-72. (22)

- Martha Brill Olcott. "Post-Soviet Kazakhstan: The Demographics of Ethnic Politics," Problems of Post-Communism, v.42, no.2, July-August 1995, pp.24-8. (5)
- 2. *Kyrgyzstan*:
 - Eugene Huskey. "The Politics of Language in Kyrgyzstan," Nationalities Papers, v.23, no.3, 1995, pp.549-72. (24)
- 3. *Tajikistan*:
 - Shahram Akbarzadeh. "Why Did Nationalism Fail in Tajikistan?" Europe-Asia Studies, v.48, no.7, 1996, pp.1105-29. (25)
- 4. *Uzbekistan*:
 - John Schoeberlein-Engel. "The Prospects for Uzbek National Identity," Central Asia Monitor, no.2, 1996, pp.12-20. (9)
 - William Fierman. "Problems of Language Law Implementation in Uzbekistan," Nationalities Papers, v.23, no.3, 1995, pp.573-95. (23)

Week 5: Achieving Domestic Stability: Preventing Ethnic and Civil Wars (214)

Comparative Perspectives: (87)

- Donald Horowitz. "Democracy in Divided Societies: The Challenge of Ethnic Conflict," Journal of Democracy, v.4, October 1993, pp.18-33. (16)
- Chaim Kaufmann. "Possible and Impossible Solutions to Ethnic Civil Wars," International Security, v.20, no.4, Spring 1996, pp.136-75. (40)
- Barbara F. Walter. "The Critical Barrier to Civil War Settlement," International Organization, v.51, no.3, Summer 1997, pp.335-64. (30)

Central Asia and the Caucasus: (127)

- ** Shireen T. Hunter. The Transcaucasus in Transition (Washington, DC: The Center for Strategic and International Studies, 1994) pp.97-109. (13)
- David E. Mark. "Eurasia Letter: Russia and the New Transcaucasus," Foreign Policy, Winter 1996-97, no. 105, pp.141-159. (19)
- Catherine Dale. "The Case of Abkhazia," in Lena Jonson and Clive Archer (eds.) Peacekeeping and the Role of Russia in Eurasia (Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 1996) pp.121-37. (17)
- Nora Dudwick. "The Cultural Construction of Political Violence in Armenia and Azerbaijan," Problems of Post-Communism, v.42, no.4, July-August 1995, pp.18-23. (6)
- Michael Mihalka. "Nagorno-Karabakh and Russian Peacekeeping: Prospects for a Second Dayton," International Peacekeeping, v.3, no.3, Autumn 1996, pp.16-32. (17)
- John Schoeberlein-Engel. "Conflict in Tajikistan and Central Asia: The Myth of Ethnic Animosity," Harvard Middle Eastern and Islamic Review, v.1, no.2, 1994, pp.1-55. (55)

Week 6: Crafting the Optimal Political System: Democracy or Autocracy? (240)

Comparative Perspectives: (120)

- John L. Esposito and James P. Piscatori. "Democratization and Islam," Middle East Journal, Summer 1991, v.45, no.3, pp.427-40. (14)

- Robert D. Kaplan. "Was Democracy Just a Moment?" The Atlantic Monthly, December 1997, pp.55-80. (26)
- Jose Maria Maravall. "The Myth of the Authoritarian Advantage," Journal of Democracy, v.5, no.4, October 1994, pp.17-31. (15)
- Fareed Zakaria. "The Rise of Illiberal Democracy," Foreign Affairs, November/December 1997, v.76, no.6, pp.22-43. (22)
- Juan J. Linz. "The Perils of Presidentialism," Journal of Democracy, Winter 1990, v.1, no.1, pp.51-70. (20) (*The following three articles directly debate this one.*)
- Donald L. Horowitz. "Comparing Democratic Systems," Journal of Democracy, Fall 1990, v.1, no.4, pp.73-9. (7)
- Seymour Martin Lipset. "The Centrality of Political Culture," Journal of Democracy, Fall 1990, v.1, no.4, pp.80-3. (4)
- Juan J. Linz. "The Virtues of Parliamentarism," in Larry Diamond and Marc Plattner (eds.). The Global Resurgence of Democracy (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1993) pp.138-45. (8)
- Stephen Holmes. "Superpresidentialism and its Problems," East European Constitutional Review, Fall 1993/Winter 1994 pp.123-6. (4)

Central Asia and the Caucasus: (120)

- ** Karen Dawisha and Bruce Parrott (eds.). Conflict, cleavage and change in Central Asia and the Caucasus (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1997). Choose three countries (including one or two from Central Asia *and* one or two from the Transcaucasus) and read the chapters on them. (Approx. 120 pages)

Week 7: Economy Building: Shock Therapy or Gradual Reform? (206)

Comparative Perspectives: (103)

- Anders Aslund. "The Case for Radical Reform," Journal of Democracy, v.5, no.4, October 1994, pp.63-74. (12)
- Adam Przeworski. "The Neoliberal Fallacy," Journal of Democracy, v.3, no.3, 1992, pp.45-59. (15)
- Yasutami Shimomura. "The Experiences of Transitional Economies in East Asia: Implications for Central Asia," in Boris Rumer (ed.) Central Asia in Transition (Armonk, NY: M.E. Sharpe, 1996) pp.237-72. (36)
- The World Bank. From Plan to Market: World Development Report 1996 (NY: Oxford University Press, 1996) pp.9-21. (13)
- Jeffrey Sachs. "Geography and Economic Transition," mimeo, paper presented at Hebrew University, Jerusalem, Israel, in memory of Dr. Michael Bruno, December 1997. (27)

Central Asia and the Caucasus: (103)

- Suzanne Goldenberg. "Economy: Trading in Chaos," in Goldenberg, Pride of Small Nations: The Caucasus and Post-Soviet Disorder (London and New Jersey: Zed Books Ltd, 1994) pp.70-80. (11)
- Michael Kaser. "Economic transition in six Central Asian economies," Central Asian Survey, v.16, no.1, 1997, pp.5-26. (22)
- Stanislav Zhukov. "Economic Development in the States of Central Asia," in Boris Rumer (ed.) Central Asia in Transition (Armonk, NY: M.E. Sharpe, 1996) pp.106-135. (30)

- Makkamjan Abdoulkadyrov. "Monetary Reform: A Comparison of the Kyrgyz Republic and the Republic of Uzbekistan," Comparative Economic Studies, v.37, no.3, Fall 1995, pp.39-47. (9)
- Lyaziza Sabyrova. "Economic Developments in Kazakhstan Since Independence," Journal of Central Asian Studies, v.1, no.1, Fall/Winter 1996, pp.46-54. (9)
- Shireen T. Hunter. "Economic Revitalization and Reform," in Hunter, Central Asia Since Independence (Westport, CT: Praeger, 1996) pp.66-87. (22)

Week 8: Strategies for Natural Resource Development: The Politics of Oil (185)

Comparative Perspectives: (78)

- Terry Lynn Karl. The Paradox of Plenty: Oil Booms and Petro-States (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1997) pp.3-7, 44-67. (28)
- Douglas A. Yates. The Rentier State in Africa (Trenton, NJ: Africa World Press, Inc., 1996) pp.11-40. (30)
- Giacomo Luciani. "Allocation vs. Production States: A Theoretical Framework," in Hazem Beblawi and Luciani (eds.) The Rentier State, vol. II (NY: Croon Helm, 1987) pp.63-82. (20)

Central Asia and the Caucasus: (107)

- Peter Sinnott. "Central Asia's Geographic Moment," Central Asia Monitor, no.4, 1997, pp.22-31. (10)
- US Department of State. "Caspian Region Energy Development," report to the US Congress, 14 January 1997. (36)
- S. Frederick Starr. "Power Failure: American Policy in the Caspian," The National Interest, Spring 1997, no.47, pp.20-31. (12)
- Stephen Blank. "Russian Policy and Central Asian Energy, Economics and Security," Demokratizatsiya, v.3, no.2, Spring 1995, pp.187-208. (22)
- Stephen Blank. "Energy and Security in Transcaucasia," Problems of Post-Communism, v.42, no.4, July-August 1995, pp.13-17. (5)
- Robert O. Freedman. "Russia and Iran: A Tactical Alliance," SAIS Review, Summer-Fall 1997, v.17, no.2, pp.93-109. (17)
- Pauline Jones Luong. "Strategy for Energy Development in Central Asia: International Implications," Policy Memo No.22, Program on New Approaches to Russian Security series, Cambridge, MA, October 1997. (5)

Week 9: The Importance of Leaders (197)

Comparative Perspective:

- ** Samuel Huntington. Political Order in Changing Societies. pp.344-96. (53)

Central Asia and the Caucasus: (144)

- ** Martha Brill Olcott. "Nursultan Nazarbaev and the Balancing Act of State Building," in Timothy J. Colton and Robert C. Tucker (eds.) Patterns in Post-Soviet Leadership (Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 1995) pp.169-90. (22)
- ** Donald S. Carlisle. "Islam Karimov and Uzbekistan: Back to the Future?" in Timothy J. Colton and Robert C. Tucker (eds.) Patterns in Post-Soviet Leadership (Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 1995) pp.191-216. (26)
- ** Nancy Lubin. "Leadership in Uzbekistan and Kazakhstan: The Views of the Led," in Timothy J. Colton and Robert C. Tucker (eds.) Patterns in Post-Soviet Leadership (Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 1995) pp.217-34. (18)

- ** Ronald Grigor Suny. "Elite Transformation in Late-Soviet and Post-Soviet Transcaucasia, or What Happens When the Ruling Class Can't Rule?" in Timothy J. Colton and Robert C. Tucker (eds.) Patterns in Post-Soviet Leadership (Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 1995) pp.141-68. (18)
- Carolyn McGiffert Ekedahl and Melvin A. Goodman. The Wars of Eduard Shevardnadze (University Park, PA: The Pennsylvania State University Press, 1997) pp.7-28, 257-89. (55)
- Thomas Goltz. "Of Caspian Oil, Beltway Bandits and Post-Soviet Sleaze," mimeo, 1997. (5)

Week 10: Spring Break

PART III: ACHIEVING EXTERNAL SECURITY (& PAPER PRESENTATIONS)

Week 11: Choosing a Military Strategy (133)

Comparative Perspectives: (55)

- Charles Tilly. "War Making and State Making as Organized Crime," in Peter B. Evans et al (ed.) Bringing the State Back In (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1985) pp.169-91. (23)
- Michael C. Desch. "War and Strong States; Peace and Weak States?" International Organization, v.50, no.2, Spring 1996, pp.237-68. (32)

Central Asia and the Caucasus: (78)

- Jonathan Aves. "National Security and Military Issues in the Transcaucasus: The Cases of Georgia, Azerbaijan, and Armenia," in Bruce Parrott (ed.) State Building and Military Power in Russia and the New States of Eurasia (Armonk, NY: M.E. Sharpe, 1995) pp. 209-233. (25)
- Bess A. Brown. "National Security and Military Issues in Central Asia," in Bruce Parrott (ed.) State Building and Military Power in Russia and the New States of Eurasia (Armonk, NY: M.E. Sharpe, 1995) pp.234-251. (18)
- Maxim Shashenkov. "Central Asia: Emerging Military-Strategic Issues," in Jed C. Snyder (ed.) After Empire: The Emerging Geopolitics of Central Asia (Ft. McNair, Washington, DC: National Defense Univ. Press, October 1995) pp.85-119. (35)

Week 12: Achieving Independence: Forging a Relationship with Russia (113)

- Sherman Garnett. "Russia's Illusory Ambitions," Foreign Affairs, March/April 1997, v.76, no.2, pp.61-76. (16)
- Abraham S. Becker. "Russia and Economic Integration in the CIS," Survival, v.38, no.4, Winter 1996-97, pp.117-36. (20)
- Martha Brill Olcott. "Sovereignty and the 'Near Abroad,'" Orbis, v.39, no.3, Summer 1995, pp.353-67. (15)
- ** Martha Brill Olcott. Central Asia's New States: Independence, Foreign Policy, and Regional Security (Washington, DC: United States Institute of Peace Press, 1996) pp.39-56. (18)

- Henry E. Hale. "Islam, State-Building and Uzbekistan's Foreign Policy," in Ali Banuazizi and Myron Weiner (eds.) The New Geopolitics of Central Asia and Its Borderlands (Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 1994) 136-71. (36)
- Natsuko Oka. "Kazakhstan and Efforts at Economic Integration with other CIS States: The Customs Union and the Single Economic Space," Central Asia Monitor, no.4, 1997, pp.14-21. (8)

Week 13: Choosing International Partners: The New Great Game (129)

Comparative Perspective: (16)

- Robert H. Bates. "The Impulse to Reform in Africa," in Jennifer Widner (ed.) Economic Change and Political Liberalization in Sub-Saharan Africa (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1994) pp.13-28. (16)

Central Asia and the Caucasus: (154)

- ** Shireen T. Hunter. The Transcaucasus in Transition (Washington, DC: The Center for Strategic and International Studies, 1994) pp.43-57; 91-6; 137-41; 142-78. (63)
- ** Martha Brill Olcott. "Failed Ethnic Cards," in Olcott, Central Asia's New States: Independence, Foreign Policy, and Regional Security (Washington, DC: United States Institute of Peace Press, 1996) pp.21-38. (18)
- ** Gregory Gleason. The Central Asian States: Discovering Independence (Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 1997) pp.136-167. (32)

Week 14: Relations Among Central Asian States (82)

- Shireen T. Hunter. "Intra-Central Asian Relations," in Hunter, Central Asia Since Independence (Westport, CT: Praeger, 1996) pp.91-106. (16)
- Heribert Dieter. "Regional integration in Central Asia: current economic position and prospects," Central Asian Survey, v.15, nos.3/4, 1996, pp.369-86. (18)
- ** Martha Brill Olcott. Central Asia's New States: Independence, Foreign Policy, and Regional Security (Washington, DC: United States Institute of Peace Press, 1996) pp.139-60. (22)
- Martha Brill Olcott. "Ceremony and Substance: The Illusion of Unity," in Michael Mandelbaum (ed.) Central Asia and the World (NY: Council on Foreign Relations Press, 1994) pp.17-46. (30)
- Serik Primbetov. "Central Asia: Prospects for Regional Integration," in Bartlomiej Kaminski (ed.) Economic Transition in Russia and the New States of Eurasia (Armonk, NY: M.E. Sharpe, 1997) pp.159-170. (12)